NEAL & HARWELL, PLC

LAW OFFICES SUITE 2000

JAMES F NEAL AUBREY B HARWELL, JR JON D ROSS JAMES F SANDERS THOMAS H DUNDON RONALD G HARRIS RONALD G HARRIS ALBERT F MOORE PHILIP N ELBERT JAMES G THOMAS WILLIAM T RAMSEY JAMES R KELLEY MARC T MCNAMEE GEORGE H CATE, III PHILIP D IRWIN A SCOTT ROSS

GERALD D NEENAN

NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE 37219-2498 57 20 PM W DAVID BRIDGERS KENDRA E SAMSON

TELEPHONE (615) 244-1713

March 26, 2004

MARK P CHALOS DAVID G THOMPSON FACSIMILE
(615) 726-0573

ELIZABETH S TIPPING

OF COUNSEL JOHN D CLARKE

VIA HAND DELIVERY

Hon. Kim Beals, Pre-Arbitration Officer Tennessee Regulatory Authority 460 James Robertson Parkway Nashville, TN. 37238

Re: Docket Nos. 00-00523, 03-00585 (consolidated)

Dear Ms. Beals:

Enclosed please two originals and fourteen copies of the Coalition's "Response In Opposition to Motion Regarding CMRS Providers' First Set of Interrogatories" to be filed in the above-referenced proceedings.

Copies of the "Preliminary Motion To Dismiss Or, In The Alternative, To Add An Indispensable Party" are being provided to each of the parties, as indicated on the attached Certificate of Service. Please direct any questions regarding this filing to me at your convenience.

> Sincerely yours, Bee Ramsey

William T. Ramsey

cc: Hon. Ron Jones, Director

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been served on the parties of record indicated below via U.S. Mail and via electronic mail. William J Ramen

Russ Minton, Esq Citizens Communications 3 High Ridge Park Stamford, Connecticut 06905

Henry Walker, Esq Jon E Hastings, Esq. Boult, Cummings, et al PO Box 198062 Nashville, Tn 37219-8062

James Wright, Esq. Sprint 14111 Capitol Blvd NCWKFR0313 Wake Forest, North Carolina 27587

J Gray Sasser J Barclay Phillips, Esq. DanElrod, Esq. Miller & Martin 1200 One Nashville Place 150 Fourth Avenue North Nashville, Tn 37219

James Lamoureux, Esq AT&T 1200 Peachtree St N E Atlanta, Ga 30309

Donald L Scholes Branstetter, Kılgore, et al 227 Second Ave N. Nashville, Tn 37219

Timothy Phillips, Esq. Office of the Tennessee Attorney General PO Box 20207 Nashville, Tn. 37202

Guy M. Hıcks, Esq. Joelle Phillips, Esq. BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. 333 Commerce St, Suite 2101 Nashville, Tn. 37201-3300

Certificate of Service, Page 2

R Douglas Lackey, Esq.
J Phillips Carver, Esq
Parkey Jordan, Esq.
BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc.
675 W Peachtree St. N W Suite 4300
Atlanta, Ga 30375

Elaine Critides, Esq John T Scott, Esq Charon Phillips, Esq Verizon Wireless 1300 I Street N W. Suite 400 West Washington, D C. 20005

Paul Walters, Jr, Esq 15 East 1st Street Edmond, Ok 73034

Suzanne Toller, Esq Davis Wright Temaine One Embarcadero Center #600 San Francisco, Calif 94111-3611

Beth K Fujimoto, Esq. AT&T Wireless Services, Inc. 7277 164th Ave, N E Redmond, Wa. 90852

Monica M Barone, Esq Sprint 6450 Sprint Parkway Overland Park, Ks 66251

Mr Tom Sams Cleartalk 1600 Ute Ave. Grand Junction, Co 81501

Dan Menser, Esq Marin Fettman, Esq c/o T Mobile USA, Inc 12920 SE 38th St. Bellevue, Wa. 98006

Mark J Ashby Cingular Wireless 5565 Glennridge Connector Suite 1700 Atlanta, Ga 30342

BEFORE THE TENNESSEE REGULATORY AUTHORITY NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE

IN RE:	
Generic Docket Addressing Rural Universal Service) Docket No. 00-00523
Petition of Cellco Partnership d/b/a Verizon Wireless for Arbitration under the Telecommunications Act) Docket No. 03-00585
PESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO MO) TION PECAPDING

CMRS PROVIDERS' FIRST SET OF INTERROGATORIES

on behalf of

Ardmore Telephone Company, Inc. Ben Lomand Rural Telephone Cooperative, Inc. **Bledsoe Telephone Cooperative** CenturyTel of Adamsville, Inc. CenturyTel of Claiborne, Inc. CenturyTel of Ooltewah-Collegedale, Inc. Concord Telephone Exchange, Inc. Crockett Telephone Company, Inc. Dekalb Telephone Cooperative, Inc. Highland Telephone Cooperative, Inc. **Humphreys County Telephone Company** Loretto Telephone Company, Inc. North Central Telephone Cooperative, Inc. **Peoples Telephone Company** Tellico Telephone Company, Inc. **Tennessee Telephone Company** Twin Lakes Telephone Cooperative Corporation **United Telephone Company** West Tennessee Telephone Company, Inc. Yorkville Telephone Cooperative

"The Coalition of Small LECs and Cooperatives"

BEFORE THE TENNESSEE REGULATORY AUTHORITY NASHVILLE, TENNESSEE

IN RE:		
Generic Docket Addressing Rural Universal Service)	Docket No. 00-00523
)	
Petition of Cellco Partnership d/b/a Verizon Wireless)	Docket No. 03-00585
for Arbitration under the Telecommunications Act)	
)	

RESPONSE IN OPPOSITION TO MOTION REGARDING CMRS PROVIDERS' FIRST SET OF INTERROGATORIES

The Rural Independent Coalition (hereafter referred to as the "Coalition" or the "Independents") submits the following Response in Opposition to Motion Regarding CMRS Providers' First Set of Interrogatories:

STATEMENT OF THE CASE

On March 2, 2004, the TRA entered an Order setting forth the procedural schedule in this matter. See Order Establishing Procedural Schedule (Mar. 2, 2004). In that Order, the parties were required to file and serve discovery requests by March 19, 2004. Id. Parties are required to file and serve responses and objections to those discovery requests by March 29, 2004. Id.

On March 19, 2004, the CMRS Providers served discovery requests to be answered by each of the individual members of the Coalition. See First Set of Interrogatories of the CMRS Providers Directed to Each of the Members of the Rural Coalition of Small LECs and Cooperatives (hereinafter "Interrogatories"). Those discovery requests have 38 numbered requests, but many of the requests have subparts. See id. A conservative count of the requests and all subparts results in the CMRS providers submitting 58 discovery requests to each individual member of the coalition. See id. This number is, of course, in excess of the 40

The requests are labeled "Interrogatories," but also include requests for production within the requests

request limit set forth in the TRA's procedural rules. See Tenn. Reg. Auth. R. 1220-1-2-.11(5)(a).

ARGUMENT

I. THE TRA SHOULD DENY THE CMRS PROVIDERS' MOTION TO PROPOUND MORE THAN 40 DISCOVERY REQUESTS ON THE INDIVIDUAL MEMBERS OF THE COALITION.

Under the rules of the TRA, parties may not submit more than 40 discovery requests, including subparts, to another party without first obtaining leave of the TRA or a Hearing Officer to exceed the limit. See Tenn. Reg. Auth. R. 1220-1-2-.11(5)(a). That motion must set forth the additional requests <u>Id.</u> The motion must also be accompanied by a memorandum establishing good cause for the service of additional requests. <u>Id.</u>

The CMRS providers served a motion with the service of their discovery requests. At no point in the motion did the CMRS providers set forth the additional requests as required by the rules. See Motion Regarding CMRS Providers' First Set of Interrogatories (hereinafter "Motion"). Rather, the CMRS providers obscured their excessive requests as unnumbered subparts within their 38 numbered requests. See Interrogatories. They then filed a perfunctory motion that asked to exceed 40 requests "to the extent" their requests "are deemed to exceed the Authority's prescribed limits." See Motion at 1-2. There can be no question that a straightforward look at the Interrogatories shows that they exceed 40 requests.

Moreover, the CMRS providers have not established good cause for the service of more than 40 discovery requests. They make the conclusory statement that it is reasonable and appropriate to allow them to serve more than 40 requests, but do not provide any real reason for that conclusion. See Motion at 1-2. They also suggest that their request is "supported by sound precedent," but do not cite any such precedent. See Motion at 2.

The CMRS providers' failure to establish good cause for exceeding 40 requests must also be considered in the context of the extremely shortened time period for responding to such requests. The TRA, at the request of the CMRS providers, ordered expedited discovery, giving parties only 10 days to respond to discovery requests. The TRA should not allow expedited discovery at the request of the CMRS providers and then also allow them to serve requests in excess of the 40 request limit set forth in the TRA's rules.

CONCLUSION

For the foregoing reasons, the Coalition respectfully requests that the TRA deny the CMRS providers' motion requesting to serve discovery requests in excess of 40.

Respectfully submitted,

NEAL & HARWELL, PLC

William T. Ramsey

2000 One Nashville Place

150 Fourth Avenue North

Nashville, Tennessee 37219

(615) 244-1713 Telephone

(615) 726-0573 Facsimile

KRASKIN, LESSE & COSSON, LLC

By: Hopher G. Kraskin (by Wig)

Kraskin, Lesse & Cosson LLC

2120 L St. N.W. Suite 520

Washington, D.C. 20037

Counsel for The Tennessee Rural Independent Coalition

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been served on the parties of record indicated below via U.S. Mail and via electronic mail on this the 26^{4} day of March, 2004.

William J Ranny

Russ Minton, Esq. Citizens Communications 3 High Ridge Park Stamford, Connecticut 06905

Henry Walker, Esq. Boult, Cummings, et al. PO Box 198062 Nashville, TN 37219-8062

Jon E. Hastings, Esq. Boult, Cummings, et al. PO Box 198062 Nashville, TN 37219-8062

James Wright, Esq.
Sprint
14111 Capitol Blvd.
NCWKFR0313
Wake Forest, North Carolina 27587

J. Gray Sasser
J. Barclay Phillips, Esq.
Dan Elrod, Esq.
Miller & Martin
1200 One Nashville Place
150 Fourth Avenue North
Nashville, TN 37219

James Lamoureux, Esq. AT&T 1200 Peachtree St. N.E. Atlanta, Ga. 30309

Certificate of Service, Page 2

Donald L. Scholes Branstetter, Kilgore, et al. 227 Second Ave. N. Nashville, TN 37219

Timothy Phillips, Esq.
Office of the Tennessee Attorney General
PO Box 20207
Nashville, TN 37202

Guy M. Hicks, Esq. Joelle Phillips, Esq. BellSouth Telecommunications, Inc. 333 Commerce St., Suite 2101 Nashville, TN 37201-3300

Elaine Critides, Esq.
John T. Scott, Esq.
Charon Phillips, Esq.
Verizon Wireless
1300 I Street N.W.
Suite 400 West
Washington, D.C. 20005

Paul Walters, Jr., Esq. 15 East 1st Street Edmond, OK 73034

Suzanne Toller, Esq.
Davis Wright Temaine
One Embarcadero Center #600
San Francisco, Calif. 94111-3611

Beth K. Fujimoto, Esq. AT&T Wireless Services, Inc. 7277 164th Ave., N.E. Redmond, WA 90852

Monica M. Barone, Esq. Sprint 6450 Sprint Parkway Overland Park, KS 66251

Certificate of Service, Page 3

Mr. Tom Sams Cleartalk 1600 Ute Ave. Grand Junction, CO 81501

Dan Menser, Esq. Marın Fettman, Esq. c/o T Mobile USA, Inc. 12920 SE 38th St. Bellevue, WA 98006

Mark J. Ashby Cingular Wireless 5565 Glennridge Connector Suite 1700 Atlanta, GA 30342